

# EXHIBIT 12

**From:** [James Kolenich](#)  
**To:** [Yotam Barkai](#); [Sequin L. Strohmeier](#); [Christopher Greene](#)  
**Subject:** Discovery responses  
**Date:** Wednesday, April 18, 2018 9:14:40 PM  
**Attachments:** [RayDiscovery.pdf](#)  
[VAdiscreponse.pdf](#)

---

Please find attached discovery responses from Robert "Azzmador" Ray and Vanguard America. These responses are provided as highly confidential pursuant to the confidentiality agreement governing this case.

Jim

--

**James E. Kolenich**  
**Kolenich Law Office**  
**9435 Waterstone Blvd. #140**  
**Cincinnati, OH 45249**  
**513-444-2150**  
**513-297-6065(fax)**  
**513-324-0905 (cell)**